

MONKLANDS REPLACEMENT PROJECT – SITE OPTION APPRAISAL PROCESS

GIVE YOUR VIEWS

Please note that the site scores do not represent a decision by the Board of NHS Lanarkshire on the location of the new University Hospital Monklands.

The Monklands Replacement Project (MRP) is NHS Lanarkshire’s exciting plan to build a new, state-of-the-art University Hospital Monklands.

We have now completed an appraisal of the three options for a site for the MRP (in alphabetical order) Gartcosh; Glenmavis; Wester Moffat.

The process, known as a “site feasibility option appraisal”, has produced a score for each site:

- Gartcosh 194.12
- Glenmavis 156.84
- Wester Moffat 195.74

The option appraisal is one of several key factors that require to be considered by the Board of NHS Lanarkshire before they recommend a preferred site option to the Cabinet Secretary for Health and Sport, who will make a final decision.

These factors include the views about the option appraisal process and its outcome that we receive from the public, NHS Lanarkshire staff and other stakeholders during a feedback period from 30 September 2020 until midnight on 18 October 2020.

Please take the time to read the summary of the option appraisal process (below) and provide your feedback by email, post or phone using the contact details below.

If you wish to read the full, detailed option appraisal report it can be found on the MRP webpage – www.monklands.scot.nhs.uk.

Give your views on the appraisal of site options for the new Monklands

The feedback period runs from 30 September 2020 until midnight on 18 October 2020.

To comment:

- Email – MRP.Team@lanarkshire.scot.nhs.uk;
- Write to – FREEPOST RTEJ-HZLK-AETZ, Communications Dept, NHS Lanarkshire, Kirklands, Fallside Road, Bothwell, G71 8BB;
- Phone – 01236 713348.

Site feasibility option appraisal process - summary

The site feasibility option appraisal process, undertaken in line with clearly defined Scottish Government requirements, involved:

STEP 1: Postal exercise to determine non-financial benefit scores

A group of over 400 public and NHS Lanarkshire staff participants – three-quarters of them members of the public – were invited to take part in a postal scoring exercise after nominating themselves either directly or through their participation in a survey. During the two-stage exercise, which was independently designed and managed by the Consultation Institute (tCI), they were invited to “weight” (assess the relative importance) of five non-financial benefits criteria, then score each site against the criteria. The benefits criteria were:

- Travel times by road and public transport – patients;
- Travel times by road and public transport – staff;
- Access/connectivity to NHS regional centres;
- Contamination (each of the possible sites requires a degree of work to remove contamination left over from its previous use)
- Impact of cross-boundary flow (ie patients from Glasgow attending the hospital)

tCI collated all the individual scores from the public and staff members and then calculated an overall non-financial benefit score for each site, using the criteria weightings and applying proportionate representation from geographical locations and staff groups.

| Gartcosh | Glenmavis | Wester Moffat |
|-----------------|------------------|----------------------|
| 5,319.07 | 4,295.15 | 4,808.18 |

STEP 2: Site feasibility option appraisal to calculate benefit scores

This involved two processes:

1. an economic appraisal (which incorporated the results of the postal exercise);
2. a risk appraisal.

Economic appraisal

The cost factor for each site was aligned with the non-financial benefit scores produced by the postal exercise to calculate each site’s “cost per benefit point”, which was then converted into a score out of 100 for each site. The prescribed way of costing, in accordance with the Scottish Capital Investment Manual (SCIM), is called Net Present Cost (NPC). This assesses the cost of building and operating the facility for a period of 60 years.

| Economic appraisal | Gartcosh | Glenmavis | Wester Moffat |
|----------------------------|-----------------|------------------|----------------------|
| Net Present Cost (000’s) | £542,800 | £521,000 | £512,500 |
| Points from postal scoring | 5,319.07 | 4,295.15 | 4,808.18 |
| NPC per benefit point | £102,047 | £121,323 | £106,589 |
| Score | 100 | 84.11 | 95.74 |

Risk appraisal

A number of concerns were raised by participants during the postal scoring exercise about factors which could have a bearing on the site selection options. These are:

- Contamination,
- Cross-boundary flow
- Transport infrastructure
- Impact on travel for those on low incomes

On the Consultation Institute's recommendation, and in line with Scottish Government guidance (the Scottish Capital Investment Manual), the first three were subject to a risk appraisal, undertaken by the MRP's external advisers, which produced a risk score for each site. This was also converted into a score out of 100 for each site. The risk scores are:

| Risk | Gartcosh | Glenmavis | Wester Moffat |
|--|-----------------|------------------|----------------------|
| Contamination – What would be the risk of greater than expected levels of contamination? | 9 | 12 | 6 |
| Cross-Boundary Flow – What would be the risk of cross-boundary flow being greater than allowed for? | 6 | 2 | 2 |
| Transport Infrastructure – what is the risk of infrastructure assumptions being wrong? | 2 | 8 | 8 |
| Risk total | 17 | 22 | 16 |
| Score | 94.12 | 72.73 | 100 |

It was agreed that the final area of concern should be considered as part of the Fairer Scotland Duty Assessment (FSDA), a process to objectively assess the socio-economic impact of each potential site location. The FSDA will be completed before decision-making on a preferred site option, and the FSDA report will be published in early October, during the feedback period, on the MRP webpage – www.monklands.scot.nhs.uk.

STEP 3: Final scores for each site

The scores from the economic appraisal and the risk appraisal were then combined, in line with the requirements of Scottish Government guidance (the Scottish Capital Investment Manual), to give the final scores for each site. These are:

| Evaluation results | Gartcosh | Glenmavis | Wester Moffat |
|---------------------------|-----------------|------------------|----------------------|
| Economic appraisal | 100 | 84.11 | 95.74 |
| Risk appraisal | 94.12 | 72.73 | 100 |
| Combined total | 194.12 | 156.84 | 195.74 |

Please note that the site scores do not represent a decision by the Board of NHS Lanarkshire on the location of the new University Hospital Monklands.