

Healthcare Improvement Scotland – Community Engagement’s Interim assessment on NHS Lanarkshire’s engagement process for the Monklands Replacement Project

June 2020

1. Introduction

In our [June 2019 report](#), the Scottish Health Council¹ assessed NHS Lanarkshire’s engagement and consultation process on a proposal to refurbish or replace University Hospital Monklands against national guidance². The report made recommendations for the next steps in this project. A summary of these recommendations, together with the actions taken by NHS Lanarkshire to respond to them and our findings to date, are detailed in appendix 1.

We have also reviewed the recommendations set out in the [Monklands Independent Review Panel report](#) which relate to engagement and indicated how we believe these requirements have been, or will be responded to moving forward (appendix 2).

This interim assessment provides details of the engagement work undertaken by NHS Lanarkshire from October 2019 up until the option scoring event on 10th March 2020. The findings are based on information that has been shared with us or is publicly available, feedback from participants and our observations at local engagement events.

The engagement work still to be undertaken, including the proposed next steps for the option appraisal and scoring process, will be reported on following its conclusion (currently anticipated to be August 2020).

2. Engagement process to date

NHS Lanarkshire has promoted the key stages in the public engagement process through a range of local press and social media activities.

Key stages to date were:

- an open process for suggesting potential site options for the new University Hospital Monklands (October-December 2019) – almost 200 suggestions were received
- shortlisting of options against five criteria (January 2020) – an additional option at Wester Moffat was identified (along with Gartcosh and Glenmavis)
- preparation and publication of supporting information on NHS Lanarkshire’s website (January-March 2020)
- engagement on shortlisted sites (January-March 2020) – four community discussion sessions; four community information events; telephone poll; and People’s Hearing
- scoring event for shortlisted sites (10th March 2020)

¹ The Scottish Health Council’s operating name changed to *Healthcare Improvement Scotland – Community Engagement* from 1 April 2020. For more information on its role please visit: www.hisengage.scot

² https://www.sehd.scot.nhs.uk/mels/CEL2010_04.pdf

3. Findings

I. **Community discussion sessions** – four events (in Airdrie, Gartcosh, Cumbernauld and Coatbridge) were held in February and attended by a total of 141 people. NHS Lanarkshire received 84 feedback forms from participants (60% response rate), which they shared with us. The feedback forms indicate that those participants came from the areas most impacted by the proposal. Responses included:

- **88%** of respondents strongly agreed or agreed that they had the chance to give their views
- **94%** of respondents strongly agreed or agreed they were able to actively contribute
- **82%** of people strongly agreed or agreed that they were confident their views had been recorded

In our experience these are high satisfaction responses when compared to those from other engagement and consultation processes.

II. **People's Hearing** – this one day event provided an open platform for people to raise specific concerns or questions regarding the external assurance information provided and to scrutinize the engagement process. The panel received four submissions for consideration – from two members of the public, elected representatives and a medical staff group.

III. **Scoring event** – from our observations at the scoring event on 10th March, we were alert to issues relating to representativeness of participants and the technical failure in the electronic voting system. We fully support NHS Lanarkshire's decision to withdraw the results and have subsequently provided advice on proposals for a postal and telephone scoring exercise. This advice has been provided in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic, with cognisance given to Scottish Government guidance on social distancing, shielding and isolation.

4. What went well

It is our view that NHS Lanarkshire appears to have been thorough in the information it has provided in response to questions and concerns people raised on key areas such as transport, groundworks and contamination. The information has been available to people during the engagement process to allow scrutiny, and updated in response to further queries demonstrating a 'live' process.

From our observations at the community discussion sessions, the issues people raised were positively listened to by the independent facilitator and NHS Lanarkshire and questions appeared to be answered. For example, checks were made that the points people raised were fully understood by reading back questions prior to responding. People were also given the opportunity to ask questions in the full group or during round table discussions.

In particular, we feel that the process has benefited from the way in which it has been made clear how people's feedback at each stage has informed the next. For example, an additional option was identified as a result of the site identification process and the non-financial benefit criteria have been changed following people's feedback from the community discussion sessions and submissions.

5. Interim assessment

On the basis of the information available to us, and our observations of the engagement that NHS Lanarkshire has undertaken to date, activity has met the expectations set out in our recommendations of June 2019, with one recommendation (Recommendation 4 in appendix 1) to be further progressed as part of the remaining planned engagement activity.

This is our interim assessment and further engagement, including option scoring, is planned to proceed in the coming months.

6. Next steps in the process

Healthcare Improvement Scotland – Community Engagement will continue to provide advice on the postal and telephone scoring exercise currently scheduled to take place in July, with engagement on the highest scoring option planned for August 2020. We advise that:

- For the postal and telephone scoring exercise, NHS Lanarkshire takes into account our feedback dated 22nd May 2020 on draft information and materials. This included: explaining the different elements of option appraisal and scoring; supporting people to participate; and describing how scores will be analyzed.
- NHS Lanarkshire uses its communications and engagement plan to undertake an inclusive process for people to receive information about the outcome of the option scoring exercise and give their views on this.

Following completion of these remaining planned engagement activities, we will provide a report detailing our feedback on all the engagement you have undertaken since October 2019 and recommending any relevant next steps.

Healthcare Improvement Scotland – Community Engagement has welcomed the constructive discussions with NHS Lanarkshire regarding its engagement approach for the Monklands Replacement Project and looks forward to our continuing dialogue.

**Healthcare Improvement Scotland – Community Engagement
June 2020**

Appendix 1 - Summary of Scottish Health Council recommendations from June 2019, actions taken in response by NHS Lanarkshire and our findings

	Scottish Health Council recommendation (June 2019)	What NHS Lanarkshire did	Findings
1.	Review the outcome of external assurance activities e.g. assessment of decontamination and groundwork costs, travel times in the travel and transport analysis, and consider whether this may require revisiting the option appraisal process if there are any material differences in relation to information that has been used to assess the options.	Comprehensive external assurance activities have been undertaken, with reports published on NHS Lanarkshire's website during January and February 2020. People were given the opportunity to raise questions or seek clarity on the information provided at a People's Hearing held on 2 March 2020.	<p>Information prepared covered many of the issues raised during consultation and further public engagement. Reports for the three candidate sites included: historical ground conditions; ground (intrusive site) investigations; site summary and Monklands Replacement Project (MRP) costs.</p> <p>A MRP Transport Strategy was published, which takes into account Transport Scotland's draft National Transport Strategy.</p> <p>The MRP Transport Strategy considers current and potential accessibility in terms of: walking and cycling, bus and rail travel, road network and drive time analysis. It also considers potential demand management measures. A paper entitled <i>Updated Drive Times</i> (collated drive time figures for peak (8am weekday) and off peak (10am weekday) showing difference from existing hospital to each of the candidate sites, was uploaded on 10th March 20.</p>
2.	Complete and publish a full, updated, equality impact assessment that takes into account the evidence received through the public consultation together with appropriate demographic and socio-economic information, and sets out any proposed	NHS Lanarkshire has published an updated interim Fairer Scotland Duty Assessment and Equality Impact Assessments for each of the candidate sites on its website to detail this information.	The interim Fairer Scotland Duty Assessment (January 2020) builds on evidence from a number of sources, including locality profiles, a Fairer Scotland Duty stakeholder workshop and focus groups held in October 2018. This work was reviewed to take account of any

	mitigating actions to take account of potential adverse impacts on any groups	It has also prepared a briefing paper on the Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation in North Lanarkshire.	<p>additional socio-economic impacts for the new shortlisted site, Wester Moffat.</p> <p>The three main themes identified from the stakeholder workshop and three focus groups (both of which included public representatives) were broadly: accessibility, travel and transport; employment; and, sense of belonging.</p>
3.	Communicate the additional external assurance work that has taken place to respond to the concerns raised during consultation and the outcome of this activity. This should include consideration of alternative options that have been put forward by respondents during the consultation.	Similar to a recommendation set by the Monklands Independent Review Panel. NHS Lanarkshire's public exercise at the end of 2019 generated a large volume of suggested sites which were reviewed and informed a short list of options. Further opportunities, including the People's Hearing, provided opportunities to consider alternative options and inform next steps.	<p>External assurance activity has been undertaken for the three sites to provide comparable information and much of this was published on NHS Lanarkshire's website in advance of the four community discussion sessions in February and People's Hearing in March 2020.</p> <p>Information stalls were organised in local healthcare settings in Airdrie, Coatbridge, Cumbernauld and at University Hospital Monklands.</p> <p>Four community discussion sessions took place in February 2020 (Airdrie, Gartcosh, Cumbernauld and Coatbridge) to gather people's views on the shortlisted sites and to invite them to consider the non-financial benefits criteria for scoring. The events were attended by a total of around 140 people and the main themes raised were: transport and parking; contamination; cross-boundary flow; socio-economic impacts; trust and the engagement process. Notes and audio recordings from the events were made publicly available on NHS Lanarkshire's website. There was visibility of the main points raised at the community discussion sessions being taken forward to the People's Hearing in March.</p>

			<p>People could join the People’s Hearing, held at the Excelsior Stadium, Airdrie, in person or through a live recording on the Monklands Facebook page. It was broadly structured into three parts: submissions received in advance, consideration of non-financial benefits criteria (drawn from the community discussion sessions and submissions), responding to questions to people in the audience or posted via Facebook. A full video recording of the session is available on NHS Lanarkshire’s website. A report on the People’s Hearing has not yet been finalised.</p> <p>The Scottish Health Council provided feedback on questions to be used for a telephone poll. The poll included questions on: people’s experience of using the acute hospitals in NHS Lanarkshire and beyond; level of awareness of the proposal to replace Monklands; and view on priorities for a new site. We have not received information on the methodology used and responses.</p> <p>NHS Lanarkshire has issued two sets of Frequently Asked Questions – these are dated July 2019 and February 2020 and reflect the different stages in the process and development of proposals.</p>
4.	Engage with local people and communities in relation to this additional information to ensure their views are understood and can be fully taken into account when any decisions are being made.	The non-financial benefits criteria have been amended to reflect feedback from previous engagement and now include consideration of contamination and impact of cross-boundary flow.	

		<p>The results of the scoring event held on 10th March were discounted due to issues around representativeness of participants and a technical failure in the electronic voting system. NHS Lanarkshire has commissioned an independent consultation agency to facilitate a postal and telephone scoring process in July³, which <i>Healthcare Improvement Scotland – Community Engagement</i> has provided on-going advice and feedback on.</p> <p>Following the outcome of the scoring process, there will be a further period of public engagement.</p>	
--	--	--	--

Appendix 2 - Summary of Monklands Independent Review Panel report recommendations relating to engagement from June 2019, actions taken in response by NHS Lanarkshire and our findings

	Monklands Independent Review Panel report – recommendations relating to engagement (June 2019)	What NHS Lanarkshire did	Observations
1.	Re-evaluation of the top two scoring options:	The exercise to invite suggestions for alternative sites carried out in the latter part of 2019 resulted in a large volume of feedback from the public, with a third option being identified through shortlisting. The work being undertaken appears to address this recommendation and will be used to inform next steps.	As described above, comparable information for each of the three sites has been prepared. This evidence will be considered as part of the postal and telephone scoring process in July 2020.

³ The timeline for this engagement will be subject to consideration of the changing external context, relevant Scottish Government guidance and any restrictions that may be in place regarding the Covid-19 pandemic.

2.	Clear vision for the existing site to take account of views within the local community:	<p>This work appears to be ongoing with agreement to work with North Lanarkshire Council and the University of Strathclyde to develop proposals for future use of the existing site, with a recognition that public involvement is key to proposals.</p> <p>A separate project team/ structure will be established to take this proposal forward. Confirmation of these arrangements expected in 2020.</p>	<p>The Fairer Scotland Duty Assessment notes that relocating the hospital requires consideration of a range of mitigation measures including: <i>“NHS Lanarkshire, North Lanarkshire Council and the Scottish Government working together with the local community to ensure that should the hospital move, any new development at the vacated site benefits the community and seeks not just to mitigate the loss of the local asset but to decrease socio-economic inequalities through community development and regeneration opportunities. Specifically, the board should consider providing community healthcare facilities within the vacated site”.</i></p>
----	---	--	--